

From: [Suero, Mary Ann](#)
To: [Guerriero, Margaret](#)
Cc: [Klevs, Mardi](#); [Harris, Michael](#); [Master, Edward](#); [Mangino, Mario](#)
Subject: update: eastern sandusky
Date: Monday, June 03, 2013 4:23:00 PM
Attachments: [Update_june2013.docx](#)

Hi Margaret,

I prepared this update about what's been going on in eastern Sandusky County, OH. I didn't want something to come up about this at a Senior Managers' meeting and have you not be aware. As you will see, many things have transpired over the last few weeks. There seems to be a lot of ill will aimed at EPA and ODH, much of it, perhaps because of misunderstanding.

I think the last you heard, the attorneys for the affected families announced that benzaldehyde had been found in attic dust of all the homes they tested (five) and they believe this to be the common link in / cause of the cancer cluster. They also believe the benzaldehyde concentrations to be extremely high, exceeding EPA's Regional Screening Levels, and have suggested to the community through a town hall meeting that all their homes are contaminated and will need to be cleaned by a hazmat team.

I understand that since the attic dust sampling was not done by us, using our SOPs and with our QC, the data are of little utility to us for decision-making purposes. I also realize that EPA's Regional Screening Levels are not the appropriate benchmark against which to compare the attic dust levels. I think there would, however, be value in pointing out (but I'm not sure to whom) math errors they made in converting the benzaldehyde concentrations, and then hope that they come to more appropriate conclusions.

There's supposed to be a Clyde City Council meeting tomorrow and the Clyde City Manager is anticipating that a lot of angry folks may show up at the meeting. We may hear more about this tomorrow.

Maryann

Maryann E. Suero, PhD
US EPA Region 5 (IL, IN, MI, MN, OH, WI)
Environmental Health Scientist
Children's Health Program Manager
77 W. Jackson Blvd. (LC-8J)
Chicago, IL 60604
Phone (312) 886-9077
Fax (312) 697-2558
suero.maryann@epa.gov

Non-Responsive

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

- Among the documents included in court filings was a hazardous-substance fact sheet from the New Jersey Department of Health that states benzaldehyde may cause mutations, or genetic changes, and its cancer risk needs more study
- The suit alleges the illnesses were caused by “benzaldehyde, PCBs, Teflon, Arsenic, Dichloromethane and/or another toxin released or produced by the defendant Whirlpool.”
 - PCB’s, arsenic, and dichloromethane were all found on the Whirlpool Manufacturing Site at concentrations above EPA’s Residential Screening Level
 - Attorneys allege finding barrel(s) on or near Whirlpool Park with labeling that indicated barrel(s) contained Polytetrafluoroethylene (PTFE)
 - Suit alleges Whirlpool burned “sludge...causing a residual benzaldehyde to blanket the entire Clyde area.”
 - Benzaldehyde was found in all five attic dust samples collected by environmental consultant hired by families
- Attorneys held a Town Hall meeting on May 27, 2013; from news coverage, it looked as if about 100-150 residents were in attendance
 - Announced benzaldehyde found in all the attics tested and that benzaldehyde is a known carcinogen that will require cleaning by hazmat team; suggested benzaldehyde probably is a contaminant in all homes in the area
 - Disagreed with EPA’s decisions at several of the sites we assessed although their disagreement may be based on misunderstanding of EPA’s findings and decisions
 - Copy of the slides used by the attorneys at the town hall meeting can be found at [G://Fremont_TownHallMeeting.PDFVERSION_May2013](#)
- Clyde town council meeting will be held on Tuesday; Clyde City Manager expects a packed audience. He would like to give the public an update on the Federal role, especially on health issues.
- Per Steve Wolfe (SFD), Mark Johnson at ATSDR may have a statement prepared this week regarding the “attic dust” data that was taken by a private environmental consultant
- Anticipate City of Clyde press conference later in the 1st week of June if EPA does not make a statement regarding the lawyers’ allegations

Information about Benzaldehyde

- Benzaldehyde is widely used as a food and flavoring additive and is “Generally Recognized as Safe” by FDA, 21 CFR 182 Part A § 182.60, Synthetic flavoring substances and adjuvants
- Benzaldehyde has not undergone a complete evaluation and determination under from EPA’s Integrated Risk Information System IRIS program for evidence of human carcinogenic potential
- Critical effects for determination of the noncarcinogenic Oral RfD are forestomach lesions and kidney toxicity
- Benzaldehyde was evaluated by the National Toxicology Program (NTP), which found no evidence of carcinogenicity in rats, and some evidence of tumorigenicity in mice (non-malignant, benign tumors, or non-cancerous tumors).
- NTP does not list benzaldehyde as either a Known or Reasonably Anticipated human carcinogen (Report on Carcinogens, Twelfth Edition 2011)
- A Swedish study of indoor dust detected benzaldehyde in 373 out of 389 homes, range: 0.3 – 30 mg/kg (Nilsson et al 2005). EPA Regional Screening Level (RSL) for benzaldehyde is 7,800 ppm for residential soils (based on the Oral RfD)
- Based on a quick scan of the TRI emissions of the Whirlpool facility (using the publicly available Envirofacts system), benzaldehyde was not listed among the company's releases for the time period 1989 – 2011. In an interview for local TV, Whirlpool VP for Communications mentioned several times that benzaldehyde was not used in their core processes.